

Final Draft

Quarter-2 Output Monitoring Report

FY 2016-17

City Governance Project
Local Government Engineering Department

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	1
2. Process followed to carryout monitoring	1
3. Limitations of the monitoring	1
4. Monitoring Findings	2
4.1 Component-1: Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program (ICGIAP).....	2
Area-1: Improvement of Openness and Information Dissemination	2
Area-2: Administrative Reform	6
Area 3: Tax Reform.....	12
Area 4: Financial Reform.....	15
Area 5: Citizen’s Awareness and Participation	19
Area 6: Urban Planning and Environment Improvement	26
Area 7: Coordination System for Law Enforcement	30
4.2 Component-2: Infrastructure Development.....	31
5. Challenges of the program	35

List of Tables

Activity 1.1: Activity for e-governance initiated (T1)	2
Activity 1.2: Mass Communication Cell (MCC) established (T2)	3
Activity 1.3: City information Service Center (CISC) established.....	4
Activity 1.4: Meet with Mass public of City Corporation	4
Activity 2.1: City Development Coordination Committee (CDCC) established (T3)	6
Activity 2.2: Administrative Reform Committee (ARC) established	6
Activity 2.3: Vision and mission set in each Dept.	7
Activity 2.4: CDU established, and formulate training program (T4).....	8
Activity 2.5: Job descriptions revised	8
Activity 2.6: Initiate Kaizen Activity	9
Activity 2.7: Comprehensive Planning Unit (CPU)	9
Activity 2.8: Activate Standing Committees	10
Activity 2.9: Annual administrative report prepared and published.....	11
Activity 3.1: Improve capability/efficiency of tax assessment (T5)	12
Activity 3.2: Interim tax assessment carried out throughout the year and collection increased	13
Activity 3.3: Re-identification of source of tax	13
Activity 4.1: Introduce “financially independent accounting system” in water supply and waste management sector (T6) .	15
Activity 4.2: Diversify earnings from Business Operated by CCs (T7)	15
Activity 4.3: Establish integrated computer systems	16
Activity 4.4: Financial statement prepared, and internal audit department carryout audit within 3 months after the closure of fiscal year	16

Activity 4.5: Non-tax own revenue source increased at least by inflation rate in each year	16
Activity 4.6: All due debts to GoB and other entities fully repaid according the schedule	17
Activity 4.7: Outstanding bills older than 3 months, including: I. electricity and II. Telephone, paid in time.....	17
Activity 4.8: Budget proposal is compared with the budget and actual outlays in the previous year, displayed at the CC office	18
Activity 5.1: Civil Society Coordination Committee (CSCC) (T8).....	19
Activity 5.2: Establishment of Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) (T9).....	20
Activity 5.3: Integration of Community and Formation of Community Group (CG)	21
Activity 5.4: Gender action plan (GAP) prepared	21
Activity 5.5: Poverty reduction action plan (PRAP) prepared and implemented with inclusion of slum	22
Activity 5.6: Revision of citizen charter	23
Activity 5.7: Citizen report cards prepared, approved and implemented by CSCC.....	24
Activity 5.8: Grievance -redress cell (GRC) established with revised terms of reference and functional	24
Activity 6.1: Initiate/update master plan	26
Activity 6.2: Development control implemented (T10), N/A FOR NCC	26
Activity 6.3: Practical use of City Corporation Infrastructure Development Plan (CCIDP)	27
Activity 6.4: Establish O&M action plan (T11).....	27
Activity 6.5: Environmental Conservation Act and Environment Framework (T12)	27
Activity 6.6: Sanitary Situation	28
Activity 6.7: Solid Waste Management	28
Activity 7.1: Awareness campaign for Rule of Law (T13)	30
Activity 7.2: Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) established	30
Activity 7.3: Capacity development for Standing Committee for Law and Discipline implemented	31

1. Introduction

Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation (BME) consultant team on behalf of Project Coordination Office (PCO) carried out this output monitoring produced through ICGIAP and Infrastructure Development activities till quarter-2 of project year-3.

The objectives of monitoring was to-

- Support PCO and PIU to assess regular progress
- Facilitate proper implementation of the project interventions
- Extract lessons learned in the form of providing feedback for possible improvements, and
- Assess consistency of the progress according to plans and targets.

2. Process followed to carryout monitoring

The consultant teams followed most collaborative, interactive, consultative, feedback sharing, and participatory processes to carry out output monitoring for quarter 2, of project year-3. Broadly following steps were followed to carry out this assignment:

- Defined boundary in terms of areas, activities, tasks, targets and timeline up to Q2, project Y3
- Developed tools and conducted trial run
- Conducted introductory meeting with concerned City Corporation's officials and authorities
- Collected information from concerned City Corporation offices and verified to a limited scale at real situations
- Shared initial findings with concerned City Corporation officials and authorities to validate collected information and receive feedbacks further development, and
- Shared summery findings with project authority, GICD personnel and LGED high officials.

3. Limitations of the monitoring

Among others, the monitoring team largely faced following limitations:

- This quarterly output monitoring was the first in nature
- Monitoring was confined to ICGIAP and Infrastructure Development activities implemented at the field level in batch-1 of the project
- Absence annual implementation plans and inadequate progress reports
- Limited physical verification of outputs produced till Q2, Y3
- Frequent turnover of the focal persons at CC level
- City Council election at Narayananj, and
- Different ICGAP document introduced at field level.

4. Monitoring Findings

4.1 Component-1: Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program (ICGIAP)

Area-1: Improvement of Openness and Information Dissemination

Activity 1.1: Activity for e-governance initiated (T1)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-2, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
1.1.1 Assigned officer/ staff in charge for e-governance	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.1.2 Arranged IT based Training for concern CC staff	1 cr./CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.1.3 Organized exchange visit to other CC's introduced e-governance (As part of IT training)	1 cr./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.1.4 Arranged component wise training	1 cr./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.1.5 Developed web based MIS software	1/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No
1.1.6 Established e-services with SMS system	e-ser/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.1.7 Prepared long term plan for e-governance	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.1.8 Established dynamic Web Portal for birth/death registration, citizen charter, trade license etc.	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not applicable

Analysis:

1.1.1 Assigned officer/staff in-charge for e-governance, NCC assigned Md Moinul Islam (Urban Planar) on 28.12.2015; CoCC assigned Mr. Khairul Alam Basar (Assistant Engineer) on --/---/---; RpCC assigned A.K.M Ahshan Farid (System Analyst) on 5.1.2016; GCC assigned Mr. Sudipto Roy (System Analyst) on 11.02.2016; and ChCC assigned Md.Iqbal Hassan (Head of IT) on 12.05.2015. **But the assigned officers in NCC and CoCC reported that they do not have required IT qualification.**

1.1.2 Arranged IT based Training for concern CC staff, NCC arranged training on “Basic Computer” for 20 participants and “E-governance” for 21 participants between 11-15.10.2015 and on 15.12.2015; CoCC arranged training on “Basic Computer” for 20 participants and “E-governance” for 25 participants between 14-18.06.2015 and on 29.12.2015 respectively; ChCC arranged training on “Basic Computer” for 26 participants and “E-governance” for 25 participants on between 25-29.10.2015 and on 28.12.2015 respectively.

RpCC and GCC arranged training workshop on “E-governance” and “SMS Dissemination System and MIS Initiation” for 21 participants in each course on 23.12.2015 and 21.12.2015 respectively. **It clearly indicates that two different kind of initiatives were performed in regards to IT based training.**

1.1.3 Organized exchange visit to other CC's introduced e-governance (as part of training), none of the training course provisioned such exchange visit as an integral part.

1.1.4 Arranged component wise training, other than Basic Computer (ref. 1.1.2) in NCC, CoCC and ChCC, **no component (10) wise training was organized.**

1.1.5 Developed web based MIS software, desktop based software for MIS is in operation only at RpCC, **no web based software for MIS yet been developed and installed.**

1.1.6 Established e-services with SMS system, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC have introduced SMS system since 27.12.2015, ---/---/---, 03.12.2015, 31.12.2015 and 31.12.2015 respectively. **Note that web base MIS software with dynamic website and linking with any kind of e-services including SMS yet to develop or to be linked with existing dynamic website, if available at CC level.**

1.1.7 Prepared long term plan for e-governance, none of the CCs yet prepared long term plan for e-governance.

1.1.8 Established dynamic Web Portal for birth/death registration, Citizen Charter, Trade License etc., all 5 CCs introduced website and birth & death registration, e-tendering, trade license, and citizen charter are uploaded on website, **but dynamic web portal has to be added yet. Besides, trade license and Citizen Charter of CoCC and citizen charter of GCC has to be uploaded on website.**

Activity 1.2: Mass Communication Cell (MCC) established (T2)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-2, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
1.2.1 Established MCC with specific ToR	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.2.2 Prepared annual plans & budget	3/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No
1.2.3 Selected messages and materials for campaign approved by Mayor	All CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
1.2.4 Registered disseminated SMS to 10000 citizens by Year 2	10000/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
1.2.5 Disseminated message/materials/updates to public through different medias including SMS	2/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.2.6 Held MCC meeting	10 /CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.2.7 Prepared/ introduced SMS record keeping system	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.2.8 MCC conducted impact survey on SMS information dissemination	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.2.9 MCC prepared City Corporation Annual Report	2 /CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

1.2.1 Established MCC with specific ToR, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established MCC on 28.12.2014, 1.12.2015, 1.1.2015, 23.12.2014 and 18.12.2014 respectively. **The MCC composition of CoCC is not in accordance the document; furthermore, MCC chairperson (Mr. Fazlul Kabir) of RpCC has been transferred.**

1.2.2 Prepared annual plans & budget, only RpCC has prepared annual plans and budget for MCC in FY 2016-'17, **but not included in CC budget.**

1.2.3 Selected messages and materials for campaign approved by Mayor, the selected messages and materials for campaign were approved by the Mayors in NCC on 18.2.2016 & 13.7.2016, RpCC on 28.12.2016, GCC on 15.3.2016, and in ChCC on 17.04.2016. **Found no such initiative in CoCC.**

1.2.4 Registered disseminated SMS to 10000 citizens by Year 2, up-till Q1, Y3 RpCC and GCC registered and disseminated SMS to 7,500 citizen **and rest 3 CCs registered and disseminated SMS to 5,000 citizens.**

1.2.5 Disseminated message/materials/updates to public through different medias including SMS, CCs only disseminate seasonal greetings and tax payment information through SMS to citizen, publicity through **other medias** (local newspapers, publicity boards, leaflets, posters, stickers, making, cable TV, website and campaign activities such as rally etc.) **need further check.**

1.2.6 Held MCC meeting, out of 10 MCC quarterly meetings, NCC held 5 meetings (on 25.11.2015, 23.12.2015, 18.2.2016, 13.7.2016, & 20.12.2016); CoCC held 3 meetings (on 3.12.2015, 8.2.2016 & 31.10.2016); RpCC held 5 meetings (on 3.12.2015, 8.2.2016, 27.10.2016, 22.9.2016 & 28.12.2016); GCC held 3 meetings (11.02.2016, 5.9.2016 & 11.12.2016); and ChCC held 5 MCC quarterly meetings (on 27.12.2015, 10.3.2016, 25.4.2016, 22.9.2016 & 5.1.2017). **It indicates that except CoCC quarterly MCC meetings are getting regular trend in FY 2016-'17.**

1.2.7 Prepared/introduced SMS record keeping system, all CCs have introduced and maintained both digital and manual SMS record keeping system.

1.2.8 MCC conducted impact survey on SMS information dissemination, none of the CCs carried out impact survey on SMS information dissemination till Q2.Y3.

1.2.9 MCC prepared City Corporation Annual Report, none of the MCCs prepared Annual Report for CC till Q2.Y3.

Activity 1.3: City information Service Center (CISC) established

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
1.3.1 Established CISC	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.3.2 Assigned officer/staff in charge	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.3.3 Provided necessary logistics	As req./CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No
1.3.4 Trained relevant officials on e-governance	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A
1.3.5 Provided service of CISC	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.3.6 CISC operated according to operation plan	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.3.7 Prepared annual report	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

1.3.1 Established CISC, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established CISC on 29.12.2015, 23.12.2015, 17.1.2016, 7.1.2016 and 24.4.2016 respectively.

1.3.2 Assigned officer/staff in charge, reported that NCC assigned officer/staff in charge (Asma Begum, Vaccinator) for CISC, **but office order not found. Rest 4 CCs yet not assigned officer/staff in charge and make CISC functional.**

1.3.3 Provided necessary logistics, PCO supplied necessary logistics to CC's for City Information Centre (CISC) offices so far, **but only NCC, RpCC and GCC CISC offices are furnished with supplied logistics in designated room.**

1.3.4 Trained relevant officials on e-governance, Asma Begm from NCC, Md. Fakhru Alam Titu from CoCC and Md. Abu Hanif from ChCC were provided training on "Basic Computer Operation" between 3-7.4.2016, 20-24.3.2016, and 20-24.3.2016 respectively. **RpCC and GCC did not provide such training to any staff.**

1.3.5 Provided service of CISC, NCC City Information Service Center (CISC) is functioning from long ago with provisioning of minimum basic services e.g. issuance of certificates & licenses, birth & death registration etc. for citizen, **Rest 4 CCs are yet to start CISC functioning .**

1.3.6 CISC operated according to operation plan, **CISC somehow started operation in NCC, but none of the CCs have their CISC operation plan.**

1.3.7 Prepared annual progress report, none of the CISCs prepared annual progress report till Q2.Y3

Activity 1.4: Meet with Mass public of City Corporation

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
1.4.1 Selected issues for mass public meeting	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No
1.4.2 Examined selected issues by Communication Standing Committee	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
1.4.3 Approved selected issues by	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
CSCC & CC meeting											
1.4.4 Declared date for Mass Public Meeting by MCC	4/CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No
1.4.5 Informed selected issues to the citizens at least one month before	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes
1.4.6 Held Mass Public Meeting	4/ CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
1.4.7 Prepared report on Mass Public Meeting	4/CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
1.4.8 Prepared next year plans and specific budget for Mass Public Meeting	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

1.4.1 Selected issues for mass public meeting, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC approved MCC selected issues mass public meeting issues on 18.2 & 13.7.2016; 3.12.2015 & 28.12.2016; 1.2.2016 and ---/---/--- respectively. **CoCC did not have such initiative.**

1.4.2 Examined selected issues by Communication Standing Committee, MCC selected issues for Mass Public Meeting examined by Communication Standing Committee only at NCC on ---/---/---. MCC of rest 4 CCs were also selected issues for Mass Public Meeting **but those were not presented to Communication Standing Committee for examination.**

1.4.3 Approved selected issues by CSCC & CC meeting, MCC selected issues for Mass Public Meeting were approved by CSCC at NCC on --/---/--- & 22.9.2016 and City Council meeting on 23.3.2016 & 20.7.2016 respectively; at RpCC by Secretary on 22.12.2015; and GCC by City Council on 25.2.2016. **In GCC issues were not approved through CSCC and in CoCC, RpCC and ChCC have not approved through CSCC and City Council either. Besides, at NCC the selected issues were approved City Council prior to City CSCC.**

1.4.4 Declared date for Mass Public Meeting by MCC, declared Mass Public meeting dates by MCC at NCC 18.2.2016 & 13.7.2016; RpCC 22.12.2015; and GCC 11.2.2016. **CoCC and ChCC did not declared Mass Public Meeting dates by MCC.**

1.4.5 Informed selected issues to the citizens at least one month before, NCC informed Mass Public meeting issues to the citizens a week ago of meeting dates, instead of a month, ChCC informed selected meeting issues to the citizens a month ago. **Rest 3 CCs (CoCC, RpCC, and GCC) have to initiate yet.**

1.4.6 Held Mass Public Meeting, NCC organized Mass Public Meeting on 31.3.2016 & 27.7.2016; RpCC on 29.12.2015; GCC on 15.3.2016, and ChCC on ---/---/---. **CoCC did not organized any Mass Public Meeting.**

1.4.7 Prepared report on Mass Public Meeting, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC prepared reports on Mass Public meeting, **but RpCC, GCC ChCC prepared reports on Mass Public meeting are not as per guideline. CoCC did not prepare any such report because Mass Public meeting not held.**

1.4.8 Prepared next year plans and specific budget for Mass Public Meeting, **none of the CCs prepared next year plans and specific budget for Mass public meeting till Q2.Y3.**

Area-2: Administrative Reform

Activity 2.1: City Development Coordination Committee (CDCC) established (T3)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.1.1 Established CDCC with specific ToR	1/CC	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.1.2 Assigned officer in-charge	1/CC	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	No
2.1.3 Organized workshop	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.1.4 Held CDCC quarterly meeting	10 /CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.1.5 Distributed meeting minutes to the members	10 /CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

2.1.1 Established CDCC with specific ToR, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established CDCCs in accordance with the specific ToR on 28.12.2014, 24.12.2014, 5.1.2015, 31.12.2014, and 21.12.2015 respectively. **NCC needs re-establishment of CDCC after sitting new elected CC council. CoCC could not make available CDCC member's list.**

2.1.2 Assigned officer in-charge, reported that NCC assigned Md. Mostofa Kamal Mojumder, CEO; RpCC Mr. Ruhul Amin, CEO; and GCC assigned Mr. Sultan Mahmud, CEO to perform responsibility of officer in-charge for CDCC, **but they have been transferred**. Hopefully, their successors will resume duties and responsibilities of office in-charge for CDCCs. Mr. Anupum Barua, CEO of CoCC and Md. Abul Hossain Deputy Secretary of ChCC perform duties and responsibilities of officer in-charge for CDCCs. **In none of the places office order found, meaning that it's implied responsibilities to the designated positions.**

2.1.3 Organized workshop, none of the 5 CCs organized workshop for CDCC members since its formation.

2.1.4 Held CDCC quarterly meeting, out of 10 CDCC quarterly meeting, NCC held 5 meetings (on 17.9.2015, 28.12.2015, 3.4.2016, 26.4.2016, & 9.10.2016); CoCC held 6 meetings (on 21.9.2015, 30.12.2015, 31.03.2016, 20.04.2016, 29.8.2016, & 29.12.2016); RpCC held 6 meetings (on 30.9.2015, 13.12.2015, 29.3.2016, 25.4.2016; 6.5.2016 & 27.12.2016); GCC held 6 meetings (on 23.4.2015; 30.12.2015, 21.3.2016, 20.4.2016, 29.9.2016, & 14.12.2016); and at ChCC held 5 CDCC quarterly meeting (on 30.9.2015, 21.12.2015; 1.3.2016, 18.4.2016, &29.9.2016). It appears the CDCC quarterly meetings are gradually getting regular shape.

2.1.5 Distributed meeting minutes to the members, reported that meeting minutes are distributed among the CDCC members.

Activity 2.2: Administrative Reform Committee (ARC) established

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.2.1 Established Administrative Reform Committee (ARC)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.2.2 Organized workshop on ARC	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.2.3 Conducted Regular ARC meeting	10 /CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.2.4 Produced ARC strategic plan for each department	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.2.5 Reviewed ARSP in CSCC	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.2.6 Approved ARSP in CC meeting	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.2.7 Quarterly monitoring of ARC strategic plan implementation	as req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.2.8 ARC produced final report annually	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis

2.2.1 Established Administrative Reform Committee (ARC), established ARCs in accordance with the guideline (comprises of Mayor, CEO, Secretary and department heads) at NCC on 23.12.2015, CoCC on 24.12.2014, RpCC on 1.1.2015; GCC on 23.12.2015, and at ChCC on 13.12.2015.

2.2.2 Organized workshop on ARC, organized workshop on Administrative Reform Plan, Composition, ToR and Operation Guideline of ARC at NCC, RpCC, GCC and at ChCC on 3.3.2016, 25.2.2016, 29.2.2016 and 9.3.2016 respectively. **CoCC did not organized such workshop.**

2.2.3 Conducted Regular ARC meeting, out of 10 ARC quarterly meetings NCC held 5 meetings (on 29.10.2015, 29.12.2015, 18.4.2016, 28.11.2016, & 15.1.2017); RpCC held 1 meeting (on 25.2.2016); GCC held 2 meetings (on 26.9.2016, & 15.12.2016); and ChCC held 4 ARC meetings (on 29.9.2015, 22.12.2015, 8.3.2016, & 11.1.2017). **CoCC did not held ARC meeting.**

2.2.4 Produced ARC strategic plan for each department, none of the CCs produced ARC strategic plan for each department.

2.2.5 Reviewed ARSP in CCCC, none of the CCs reviewed ARC strategic plan in CCCC, since ARC strategic plan for each department are not produce.

2.2.6 Approved ARSP in CC meeting, none of the CCs approved ARSP in their council meeting, since ARC strategic plan and ARSP for each department are not produced.

2.2.7 Quarterly monitor ARC strategic plan implementation, none of the CCs implemented ARC strategic plan, since ARC strategic plan and ARSP for each department are not produced.

2.2.8 ARC produced final report annually; none of the CCs produced annual report, since ARC strategic plans for each department are not produced.

Activity 2.3: Vision and mission set in each Dept.

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.3.1 Assigned officers in-charge from each dept.	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No
2.3.2 Organized workshop for preparing vision and mission	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.3.3 Presented draft vision and mission to standing committee meeting (Sports & Cultural)	As req/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.3.4 Approved vision and mission in City Council meeting	As req/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A
2.3.5 Displayed vision and mission	As req.	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

2.3.1 Assigned officers in charge from each department, reported that NCC, RpCC, GCC assigned officer in-charge from each department to prepare vision & mission for their own department, **but no documentary evidences found. Rest two CCs (CoCC, ChCC) were not assigned officer in-charge.**

2.3.2 Organized workshop for preparing vision and mission, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC organized workshop for preparing vision and mission for each department and CC on 13.4.2016; 5.4.2016; 19.4.2016; 11.4.2016 and 7.4.2016. **None of the CC produced workshop report.**

2.3.3 Presented draft vision and mission to standing committee meeting (Sports & Cultural), none of the departments of any CC presented draft vision and mission to the Sports & Cultural Standing Committee meeting to examine.

2.3.4 Approved vision and mission in City Council meeting, NCC and ChCC approved vision and mission in their City Council meetings on 16.5.2016 and 11.5.2016. **Rest of three CCs (CoCC, RpCC, and GCC) did not approve vision and mission in City Council meetings.**

2.3.5 Displayed vision and mission, NCC displayed vision and mission on CC website and mentioned in their Citizen Charter. Rest four CCs (CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC) have not displayed on CC website and mentioned in their Citizen Charter.

Activity 2.4: CDU established, and formulate training program (T4)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.4.1 Established CDU	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.4.2 Formulated training program (manual, plans, and budget etc.)	1/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.4.3 CDU selected training service provider	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.4.4 Facilitated/ proposed kaizen and skill training	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.4.5 Prepared quarterly progress and annual report on capacity development activities	10/2 /CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

2.4.1 Established CDU, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established CDU on 23.12.2015; 24.12.2014; 1.1.2015; 23.12.2014 and 21.12.2014 respectively. CoCC did not follow the composition as recommended in the guideline.

2.4.2 Formulated training program (manual, plans, and budget etc.), RpCC, GCC, and ChCC formulated training program in FY 2016-17. Rest two CCs (NCC& CoCC) have not formulated training program. None of CCs included training program in their budget.

2.4.3 CDU selected training service provider, none of CDUs selected training service provider.

2.4.4 Facilitated/proposed Kaizen and skill training, all 5CCs facilitated Kaizen and Skill training for CDU members together with staff from each department (ref. 2.6.4).

2.4.5 Prepared Quarterly and Annual progress report on capacity development activities, none of CDUs prepared quarterly and annual progress reports either.

Activity 2.5: Job descriptions revised

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.5.1 Prepared revise job description for all staff	All staff/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	No	N/A
2.5.2 Approved revise job descriptions by CC	All staff /CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	No	N/A
2.5.3 Circulated revised job descriptions to all staff	As required	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

2.5.1 Prepared revise job description for all staff, NCC, RpCC and ChCC prepared revise job description on 3.3.2016, 25.2.2016 and ---/---/--- respectively. CoCC and GCC didn't prepare staff Job description.

2.5.2 Approved revise job descriptions by CC, RpCC and ChCC City Council approved revise job descriptions on 23.3.2016 and 11.5.2016 respectively. NCC, CoCC and GCC are yet to present revised job description to CC council meeting for approval.

2.5.3 Circulated revised job descriptions to all staff, except ChCC none of the CCs circulated revised job descriptions to all staffs with official letter signed by Mayor.

Activity 2.6: Initiate Kaizen Activity

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.6.1 Assigned focal person by CDU	1/dept./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A
2.6.2 Formed work improvement team (WIT)	1/dept./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.6.3 Developed action plan by WIT	1/dept./CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.6.4 Trained one staff from each department on kaizen	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.6.5 Introduced Kaizen activity in each department	1/dept./CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
2.6.6 Made budget allocation for Kaizen activity	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.6.7 Compiled Annual progress report by CDU	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.6.8 Published Kaizen activity progress on website	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

2.6.1 Assigned focal person by CDU, reported that Md. Abul Hossain, Deputy Secretary of ChCC has been assigned from CDU as Kaizen Focal Person on ----/----/-----. **Rest four CCs (NCC, CoCC, RpCC and GCC) have not assigned any Focal Person from CDU to perform Kaizen activity.**

2.6.2 Formed work improvement team (WIT), none of the five CCs formed (3-5 members) Work Improvement Team (WIT) chaired by head of the department in each department to perform Kaizen activity.

2.6.3 Developed action plan by WIT, none of the WIT developed Annual Action Plan for Kaizen activity.

2.6.4 Trained one staff from each department on kaizen, PCO organized a day long training course on Kaizen for department/section heads of City Corporations on mentioned dates for NCC on 14.1.2016, CoCC on 11.1.2016, RpCC on 5.1.2016, GCC on 28.12.2015 and for ChCC on 21.12.2015.

2.6.5 Introduced Kaizen activity in each department, all CCs introduced one Kaizen activity in each department in project year2.

2.6.6 Made budget allocation for Kaizen activity, none of the five CCs made budget provision for Kaizen activity.

2.6.7 Compiled Annual progress report by CDU, none of the CDUs compiled their Annual report for CCs.

2.6.8 Published Kaizen activity progress on website, none of the five CCs published Kaizen activity progress report on their website.

Activity 2.7: Comprehensive Planning Unit (CPU)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.7.1 Established CPU	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.2 Established task force for infrastructure	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.3 Established task force for governance	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.4 Prepared draft short and long term plan	2/1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.7.5 Available rolling plan as per IDPCC guideline	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.7.6 Conduct monthly CPU meeting	30/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.7.7 Conduct CPU meeting with Urban Planning and Development Standing Committee	30/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No
2.7.8 Present activity progress to City Council meeting	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2.7.9 Prepared Annual report	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

2.7.1 Established CPU, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established CPU on 28.12.2014, 24.12.2014, 7.1.2015, 29.12.2014 and 21.12.2014 respectively. *NCC needs to include representative from all departments.*

2.7.2 Established task force for infrastructure, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established task force for infrastructure on 12.5.2016, 15.12.2014, 15.01.2014 and 21.12.2014. *CoCC has not established task force for infrastructure.*

2.7.3 Established task force for governance, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established Task Force for Governance on 12.5.2016, 15.12.2014, 23.12.2014 and 21.12.2014. *CoCC has not established Task Force for Governance.*

2.7.4 Prepared draft short and long term plan, *none of the CPUs prepared and presented draft multi-sectorial short and long term plan for CCIDP.*

2.7.5 Available rolling plan as per IDPCC guideline, *none of the CCs prepared rolling plan as per IDPCC guideline.*

2.7.6 Conduct monthly CPU meeting, out of 30 CPU monthly meetings NCC held 10 meetings (on 27.1.2015, 27.8.2015, 30.9.2015, 26.10.2015, 30.11.2015, 10.12.2015, 7.1.2016, 8.3.2016, 13.4.2016, & 12.5.2016); CoCC held 6 meetings on (8.4.2015, 14.5.2015, 7.7.2015, 28.3.2016, 29.12.2016, & 30.1.2017); RpCC held 5 meetings (on 22.4.2015, 9.11.2015, 28.3.2016, 17.8.2016 & 24.12.'16); GCC held 9 meetings (on 19.4.2015, 23.11.2015, 14.3.2016, 25.7.2016, 22.8.2016, 22.9.2016, 26.10.2016, 30.11.2016, & 18.12.2016); and ChCC held 4 CPU monthly meetings (on 24.12.2015, 18.2.2016, 19.4.2016, & 8.6.2016). It appears; monthly meeting trends are upward except RpCC. *The CC authorities (SE) expressed that they do not find justification to hold meeting in each month.*

2.7.7 Conduct CPU meeting with Urban Planning and Development Standing Committee, *none of the CPUs had meeting with Urban Planning and Development Standing Committee.*

2.7.8 Present activity progress to City Council meeting, *none of the CPUs presented their activity progress to City Council meeting.*

2.7.9 Prepared Annual report, *none of the CPUs prepared their Annual Progress report.*

Activity 2.8: Activate Standing Committees

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.8.1 Assigned officer to establish Standing Committees	1/each Sc.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.8.2 Approved Standing Committees ToR by City Council	1/each Sc.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.8.3 Proposed Standing Committees ToR to ministry for concurrence	1/each Sc.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.8.4 Held Standing Committee monthly meetings	30/each Sc.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.8.5 Prepared Annual Progress report by standing committees	2/each Sc.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

2.8.1 Assigned officer to establish Standing Committees, all 5 CCs NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC assigned officer to each Standing Committee on 13.11.2014, ----/----/---, 14.9.2015, 17.5.2016 and on 11.5.2016 respectively to act as member secretary.

2.8.2 Approved Standing Committees ToR by City Council, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC approved Standing Committee ToR in City Council meeting on 13.11.2014, ---/---/---, 25.4.2016, 16.5.2016, and on 11.5.2016 respectively. **CoCC could not mention approval date.**

2.8.3 Proposed Standing Committees ToR to ministry for concurrence, all CCs except ChCC presented their Standing Committee’s ToR to the ministry and waiting to receive ministry’s concurrence. **ChCC did received ministry’s concurrence long ago.**

2.8.4 Held Standing Committee monthly meetings, reported that Standing Committee meetings are not held in every month, rather meetings are held need based. Even, in many cases meetings minutes are not prepared and preserved properly unless it is essential e.g. F&E Standing Committee meeting minutes are prepared and preserved regularly.

2.8.5 Prepared Annual Progress report by Standing Committees, none of Standing Committees prepared their Annual Progress report.

Note that in NCC and CoCC the Standing Committees are to be re-established due to recent City council election. Furthermore, the Standing Committees tenure of GCC is over therefore it’s required to re-establish Standing Committees.

Activity 2.9: Annual administrative report prepared and published

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
2.9.1 Prepared draft Annual Administrative report	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.9.2 Approved draft Annual Administrative report in CC meeting	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.9.3 Annual Administrative report published	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

2.9.1 Prepared draft Annual Administrative report, all CCs prepared draft Annual Administrative reports for FY 2014-15 and 2015-16.

2.9.2 Approved draft Annual Administrative report in CC meeting, all City Councils approved Annual Administrative reports for FY 2014-15 and 2015-16 in their meetings.

2.9.3 Annual Administrative report published, all City Corporations published Annual Administrative reports for FY 2014-15 and 2015-16.

Area 3: Tax Reform

Activity 3.1: Improve capability/efficiency of tax assessment (T5)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
3.1.1 Deployed senior tax assessor	1/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.2 Deployed tax assessors and collectors one/1000 holdings	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.3 Introduced tax assessment manual/guideline prepared by PCO	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.4 Received training on capacity development (deployed staff)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.5 Conducted re- assessment in 5 years interval	1/CC	N/A	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.6 Introduced software for tax assessment database	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
3.1.7 Created link system between "holding tax ID number" and construction registration	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No
3.1.8 Increased Tax collection	2/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3.1.9 Prepared quarterly report	10/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

3.1.1 Deployed senior tax assessor: only ChCC deployed Senior Tax Assessor long ago. RpCC and GCC have given Senior Tax Assessor's responsibility to Secretary on 16.11.2015 and Accounts Officer on 25.1.2016. **Rest two CCs (NCC and CoCC) do not have Senior Tax Assessor.**

3.1.2 Deployed Tax Assessors and Collectors, one/1000 holdings, NCC deployed a total of 18 (2 Tax Assessors & 16 Tax Collectors) manpower to the tax section, CoCC 8 (1 Tax Assessor & 7 Tax Collector), RpCC 33 (1 Tax Officer, 3 Tax Assessors & 29 Tax Collectors), GCC 21 (6 Tax Officers, 10 Tax Assessors & 5 Tax Collectors), and ChCC deployed 176 (49 Tax Assessors & 127 Tax Collectors) manpower to Tax section on 9.6.2015, 22.3.2016, 23.11.2015, 22.3.2015 and 10.3.2016 respectively.

3.1.3 Introduced tax assessment manual/guideline prepared by PCO, all CCs introduced PCO supplied tax assessment manual/guideline.

3.1.4 Received training on capacity development (deployed staff), PCO organized three days long skill up training course on financial management software for CC deployed tax section staff between 10-12.4.2016

3.1.5 Conducted re- assessment in 5 years interval, NCC, CoCC and ChCC have started tax re- assessment in Q1 of FY 2016-17. RpCC conducted re- assessed in FY 2014-15 and GCC in FY 2013-14.

3.1.6 Introduced software for tax assessment database, NCC, CoCC and ChCC introduced computerized system for tax assessment database. Rest of two CCs (RpCC & GCC) introduced MSU software for tax assessment database in 2016. **None of the CCs use IFMS software, because the software not ready yet.**

3.1.7 Created link system between holding tax ID number and construction registration, only RpCC introduced procedure of linking holding tax ID number (Clint ID) and building permission since 9.1.2017. **Rest four CCs have to create such procedure within project Y-3.**

3.1.8 Increased Tax collection, all increased CCs tax collection amount e.g. at RpCC BDT 113,756 to 6,161,207 between quarters 2 to quarter 1, Y-3). **It requires further investigation.**

3.1.9 Prepared quarterly report, all 5 CCs prepared tax collection quarterly progress reports.

Activity 3.2: Interim tax assessment carried out throughout the year and collection increased

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
3.2.1 Identified missing holdings and bring them to assessment registration	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3.2.2 Review progress of interim assessment	When req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3.2.3 Prepared quarterly tax collection progress report	10/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3.2.4 Submitted quarterly tax collection progress report to PCO	10/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3.2.5 Prepared plan to increase holding tax collection up to 85%	1/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No
3.2.6 Increased tax collection up to 85%	As req/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

3.2.1 Identified missing holdings and bring them to assessment registration, all 5 CCs identifies and includes missing holdings on tax register book quarterly.

3.2.2 Review progress of interim assessment, all 5 CCs reviewed progress of interim tax assessment linking with Finance and Establishment Standing Committee and presented to City Council meetings.

3.2.3 Prepared quarterly tax collection progress report, all 5 CCs prepared quarterly tax collection progress reports and presented to City council meetings.

3.2.4 Submitted quarterly tax collection progress report to PCO, all 5 CCs used to submit quarterly tax collection progress report to PCO.

3.2.5 Prepared plan to increase holding tax collection, except RpCC, *none of the 5 CCs prepared plan for increasing holding tax collection up to 85%*.

3.2.6 Increased tax collection up to 85%, *none of the 5 CCs reached to increase holding tax collection up to 85%*.

Activity 3.3: Re-identification of source of tax

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
3.3.1 Examined re-identified new tax sources once a year by F&E Standing Committee	3/CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
3.3.2 Prepared proposal for new tax sources by F&E Standing Committee and submit to City Corporation	3/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
3.3.3 Held F&E Standing Committee meeting 4 times a year	10/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

3.3.1 Examined re-identified new tax sources once a year by F&E Standing Committee, the F&E Standing Committees use to examine re-identified new tax sources as their tradition. Among 5 CCs, RpCC have examined on 14.12.2015 & 28.8.2016 and GCC on 28.03.2016 & 27.12.2016.

3.3.2 Prepared proposal for new tax sources by F&E Standing Committee and submit to City Corporation, the F&E Standing Committees use to propose new tax sources to City Council meeting occasionally. In recent past, the F&E Standing Committee of RpCC and GCC proposed new tax sources on 28.12.2016 and 14.12.2016 respectively.

3.3.3 Held F&E Standing committee meeting 4 times a year, out 10 NCC F&E Standing Committees held 6 quarterly meetings (on 16.9.2015, 17.9.2015, 14.12.2015, 8.3.2016, 19.4.2016 & 5.9.2016); CoCC 5 meetings (on 30.9.2015, 29.2.2016, 9.3.2016, 21.4.2016 & 21.12.2016); RpCC 6 meetings (on 17.9.2015, 20.12.2015, 15.2.2016, 13.4.2016, 28.8.2016 & 21.12.2016); GCC held 6 quarterly meetings (on 30.9.2015, 27.12.2015, 28.3.2016; 18.4.2016, 6.9.2016 & 27.12.2016); and only ChCC held 16 monthly meetings out of 30 (on 1.9.2015, 3.9.2015, 10.10.2015, 27.10.2015, 2.12.2015, 7.2.2015, 24.3.2016, 4.5.2016, 19.6.2016, 20.7.2016, 16.8.2016, 4.9.2016, 17.10.2016, 13.11.2016, 12.12.2016, & 16.1.2017).

ChCC F&E Standing Committee meetings were held monthly and rest 4 CCS held quarterly, besides F&E standing committee meeting at NCC was suspended due to City Council election.

Area 4: Financial Reform

Activity 4.1: Introduce “financially independent accounting system” in water supply and waste management sector (T6)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.1.1 Created independent bank account for WS and WM	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.1.2 Introduced computerize accounting system for WS and WM	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.1.3 Maintained independent loss and profit account of WS and WM	2/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

4.1.1 Created independent bank account for water supply and waste management, NCC opened independent bank account for waste management on 8.11.2015, CoCC for water supply and waste management on 1.12.2015, RpCC for water supply and waste management on 1.10.2015 & 31.12.2015, GCC for water supply and waste management GCC on 25.7.1997 & 1.11.2015, and ChCC opened independent bank account for waste management on 29.11.2015.

Note that at NCC and ChCC water supplies are operated and managed by WASAs, so they don't need to open independent bank account for water supply

4.1.2 Introduced computerize accounting system for water supply and waste management, CoCC, RpCC and GCC have introduced computerize accounting system for water supply and waste management. NCC and ChCC have introduced same computerize accounting system for waste management only, because water supply account is maintained WASAs in those two cities. **Need to know the dates.**

4.1.3 Maintained independent loss and profit account of water supply and waste management, CoCC, RpCC and GCC use to maintain monthly income and expenditure accounts for both WS and WM. NCC and ChCC use to maintain monthly income and expenditure account for WM only because in both Corporation's water supplies are operated by WASAs, **but none of the CCs maintains loss and profit account in real term.**

Activity 4.2: Diversify earnings from Business Operated by CCs (T7)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.2.1 Examined diversification of business operated by CC at F&E Standing Committee	As required/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
4.2.2 Prepared proposal for new business activities at F&E Standing Committee and submitted to CC Council meeting for action according to Act 2009	As required/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

4.2.1 Examined diversification of business operated by CC at F&E Standing Committee, reported that all the F&E Standing Committees are aware about issues and used to examine CC operated business diversification whenever necessary, **but in recent past(during this quarter) none of the F&E Standing Committee did so.**

4.2.2 Prepared proposal for new business activities at F&E Standing Committee and submitted to CC Council meeting for action according to Act 2009, **none of the E&E Standing Committees prepared new business activity proposals in writing, but the proposals are approached to CC council meeting by F&E Standing Committee verbally for decision and onward action.**

Activity 4.3: Establish integrated computer systems

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.3.1 Installed the integrated software (IFMS) and linked to accounting, tax database, reserve fund for rehabilitation and budget	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
4.3.2 Provided staff training on operation of IFMS software	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

4.3.1 Installed the integrated software (IFMS) and linked to accounting, tax database, reserve fund for rehabilitation and budget, IFMS software is not ready yet for installation.

4.3.2 Provided staff training on operation of IFMS software, training on operation of IFMS software remains pending, since the said software is not ready and installed in any of the 5 CCs.

Activity 4.4: Financial statement prepared, and internal audit department carryout audit within 3 months after the closure of fiscal year

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.4.1 Prepared financial statement within the flowing month of each FY	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.4.2 Disclosed financial statement at CC notice board	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
4.4.3 Conducted internal audit within three months of each FY	2/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A
4.4.4 Submitted internal audit report to City Corporation meeting and PCO	2/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

4.4.1 Prepared financial statement within the flowing month of each FY, all 5 CCs prepared financial statements for FY 2014-'15 and 2015-'16 within the flowing month of each year.

4.4.2 Disclosed financial statement at CC notice board, all 5 CCs disclosed financial statement for FY 2014-'15 and 2015-'16 in their offices, not publicly.

4.4.3 Conducted internal audit within three months of each FY, NCC conducted internal audit for FY 2015-'16 (on ---/---/---); RpCC for FY 2014-'15 (on 29.3.'16) & FY 2015-'16 (on 7.9.'16); and ChCC conducted for FY 2015-'16 (on 27.9.'16). Rest two CCs (CoCC & GCC) could not produce internal audit report for FY 1014-15 and FY 2015-'16 either.

4.4.4 Submitted internal audit report to City Council meeting and PCO, NCC, RpCC and ChCC submitted internal audit report to City Council meetings. Rest two CCs (CoCC & GCC) didn't submit internal audit report in their City Council meetings and none of the 5 CCs submitted internal audit report to PCO.

Activity 4.5: Non-tax own revenue source increased at least by inflation rate in each year

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.5.1 Updated annual plan for non-tax revenue collection	3/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.5.2 Monitored progress of implementation of this plan every month	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.5.3 Reviewed updated non-tax revenue collection status every month by CEO/Secretary	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4.5.4 Reviewed progress of other non-tax revenue in the monthly meeting of CC	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

4.5.1 Updated annual plan for non-tax revenue collection, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC updated their annual non-tax revenue collection plan for last 3 years. CoCC could not produce such document.

4.5.2 Monitored progress of implementation of this plan every month, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC monitored implementation progress of annual non-tax revenue plan every month. CoCC could not produce such document.

4.5.3 Reviewed updated non-tax revenue collection status every month by CEO/Secretary, the CEO/Secretary of NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC used to review non-tax revenue collection status every month. CoCC could not produce such document.

4.5.4 Reviewed progress of other non-tax revenue in City Council monthly meeting, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC used to review progress of non-tax revenue collection status in their City Council meetings. CoCC could not produce such document.

Activity 4.6: All due debts to GoB and other entities fully repaid according the schedule

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.6.1 Reviewed documents related to all due debts of GoB and others	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
4.6.2 Prepared budget provision for full repayment	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.6.3 Prepared quarterly repayment statement on all due debt and send to PCO	10/CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

4.6.1 Reviewed documents related to all due debts of GoB and others, all 5 CCs used to review all documents related to due debts of GoB and others according to their schedule and re-paid up to Q2 of FY 2016-17.

4.6.2 Prepared budget provision for full repayment, except RpCC, other 4 CCs kept budget provision for full repayment of debts to GoB and other departments, but RpCC repaid part of debts of GoB and other departments from different cost head.

4.6.3 Prepared quarterly repayment statement on all due debt and send to PCO, out of 10 NCC sent 3 repayment statements to PCO (on 13.12.2015 for Q2, Y-2; on 10.4.2016 for Q3, Y2; & on 10.4.2016 for Q4, Y2); RpCC sent 1 (on 28.3.2016 for Q1, Q2 & Q3, Y2); and GCC sent 3 repayment statements to PCO (on 24.12.2015 for Q1 and Q2, Y2 & on 8.11.2016 for Q2, Y3) CoCC and ChCC have not sent any repayment statements to PCO.

Activity 4.7: Outstanding bills older than 3 months, including: I. electricity and II. Telephone, paid in time

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.7.1 Ensured regular receipt of electricity and telephone bills	30/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4.7.2 Settled dispute over arrear electricity and telephone bills	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.7.3 Provisioned in annual budget for electricity and telephone bill payment	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.7.4 Paid electricity and telephone bill regularly	30/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4.7.5 Reviewed progress of bill payment in CC monthly meeting	30/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

4.7.1 Ensured regular receipt of electricity and telephone bills, reported that all 5 CCs used to receive electricity and telephone bills regularly.

4.7.2 Settled dispute over arrear electricity and telephone bills, all 5 CCs settled dispute over arrear electricity and telephone bills. **But ChCC could not settled electricity bills for street light since 2005.**

4.7.3 Provisioned in budget for electricity and telephone bill payment, observed that all 5 CCs provisioned in their annual budget FY 2015-16 and 2016-17 for payment of electricity and telephone bills.

4.7.4 Paid electricity and telephone bill regularly, all of the 5 CCs paid electricity and telephone bill regularly.

4.7.5 Reviewed progress of bill payment in CC monthly meeting, the CEO/Secretary of all 5 CCs used to review monthly utility bills payment status and presents to City Council meeting for review as well.

Activity 4.8: Budget proposal is compared with the budget and actual outlays in the previous year, displayed at the CC office

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
4.8.1 Prepared draft budget proposal in accordance with the budget and actual outlays of the previous year	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.8.2 Obtained comments/ suggestions on draft budget (disclosed and displayed) from citizens and CSCCs	3/ CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	NA
4.8.3 Finalized and approved budget in City Council meeting	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

4.8.1 Prepared draft budget proposal in accordance with the budget and actual outlays of the previous year, all 5 CCs used to prepare draft budget proposal before starting of FY in accordance with the budget and actual outlay of the pervious year.

4.8.2 Obtained comments/suggestions on draft budget (disclosed and displayed) from citizens and CSCCs, reported that all 5 CCs used to have pre-budget discussion in CSCC meeting to obtain comments and suggestions on draft budget and do necessary for further development, **but not disclosed and displayed for comments and suggestions from citizens publicly.**

4.8.3 Finalized and approved budget in CC meeting, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC finalized and approved annual budget for FY 2016-17 in their CC meetings on 16.5.2016, 15.6.2016, 29.9.2016, 28.7.2016 and 9.10.2016 respectively.

Area 5: Citizen's Awareness and Participation

Activity 5.1: Civil Society Coordination Committee (CSCC) (T8)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
5.1.1 Established CSCC in accordance with composition and ToR	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.1.2 Assist, supervise and monitor the progress of CCIDP implementation according to guidelines	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.1.3 Sector-wide working group facilitated need identification and prioritization	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.1.4 Obtained approval of CAP from CC	Communities/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No
5.1.5 CSCC quarterly general meeting	10/CC	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.1.6 Identified women citizen's role in solving CC related problem/ issue	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.1.7 Took appropriate & effective decisions for increasing revenue income	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.1.8 Prepared proposals for advocacy for urban policy reform	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.1.9 Gave necessary recommendations on CC proposed budget for next year	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.1.10 Recorded CSCC meeting decisions and follow-up action/status of implementation	As req.	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

5.1.1 Established CSCC in accordance with composition and ToR, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established CSCCs in accordance with the composition and specific ToR on 8.9.2015, 24.12.2014, 5.1.2015, 6.10.2015 and 4.11.2015 respectively. **NCC need to re-establish CSCC after sitting new elected City Council. It is important to introduce 2nd phase ToR for CSCC in all CCs.**

5.1.2 Assist, supervise and monitor the progress of CCIDP implementation according to guidelines, all 5 CCs provides necessary assistance, supervision, guidance and progress monitoring support in implementing Infrastructure Development Plan (IDP) by CSCCs. **More vibrant role in particular to supervision and progress monitoring of IDP is needed.**

5.1.3 Sector-wide working group facilitated need identification and prioritization, **none of the 5 CCs established working group as part of CSCC to facilitate sector-wise need identification and prioritization.**

5.1.4 Obtained approval of CAP from CC, GCC approved only 10 CAPs on 20.12.2016, **reported that rest are under process.**

5.1.5 CSCC quarterly general meeting, Out of 10 CSCC quarterly meetings held in NCC 4 meetings (on 2.9.2015, 27.12.2015, 29.3.2016, & 28.4.2016); CoCC 5 meetings (on 21.9.2015, 30.12.2015, 31.3.2016, 20.4.2016, & 29.12.2016); RpCC 6 meetings (on 22.9.2015, 14.12.2015, 28.3.2016, 25.4.2016, 07.9.2016 & 29.12.2016); GCC 6 meetings (on 14.10.2015, 30.12.2015, 21.3.2016, 24.4.2016, 22.9.2016 & 14.12.2016); and ChCC 6 meetings (on 29.11.2015, 7.3.2016, 20.4.2016, 28.4.2016, 28.9.2016 & 23.2.'17). **Note that NCC had fewer meetings due to City Council election.**

5.1.6 Identified women citizen's role in solving CC related problem/ issue, **no such initiative observed.**

5.1.7 Took appropriate & effective decisions for increasing revenue income, all 5 CCs took several appropriate and effective decisions to increase revenue income, such as, identifying missing holdings, tax re-assessment at 5 years interval, tax rebate, organizing tax fair, raising citizen awareness, increasing tax collectors, skill development training for tax section staff, introducing computer based tax accounting system etc.

5.1.8 Prepared proposals for advocacy for urban policy reform, none of the 5 CSCCs prepared proposals for advocacy for urban policy reform.

5.1.9 Gave necessary recommendations on CC proposed budget for next year, CSCCs in all 5 City Corporation provided necessary recommendations on CC proposed annual budget as usual.

5.1.10 Recorded CSCC meeting decisions and follow-up action/ status of implementation, CSCC meetings are recorded with follow-up actions and status of implementation in all 5 CCs.

Activity 5.2: Establishment of Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) (T9)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
5.2.1 Established Ward Level Coordination Committees (WLCCs) in each ward	ward/CC	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.2.2 Arranged WLCC meeting	10/CC	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.2.3 Reviewed progress of civil works (quality and problems)	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.2.4 Presented progress of civil works in CSCC meeting (through ward councilors)	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.2.5 Conducted awareness raising activity for payment of tax and user charges	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.2.6 Involved implementation and management of WASH, SW, street light etc.	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.2.7 Arranged open discussion on overall activities(inviting 150 citizens) twice a year	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

5.2.1 Established Ward Level Coordination Committees (WLCCs) in each ward, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established WLCCs in each ward on 1.11.2015, 28.8.2015, 6.10.2015 and 5.11.2015 respectively and CoCC in different date on (----/-----/-----) Q4, Y1. *NCC need to re-establish WLCCs after sitting recent elected City Council. In regards to female representation in WLCC, observed deviation between ICGIAP and Guideline.*

5.2.2 Arranged WLCC meeting, in NCC held 4 WLCC meetings between Q2, Y2 and Q2, Y3; CoCC 4 meetings Q4, Y1 and Q2, Y3; RpCC held 6 meetings between Q1, Y2 and Q2, Y3; GCC held 4 meetings Q2, Y2 and Q2, Y3; and ChCC held 4 WLCC meetings between Q2, Y2 and Q2, Y3. *Note that the Project Steering Committee (PSC) made decision for at least two WLCC meetings in a year, and observed great deviation between ICGIAP and practice of WLCC meeting e.g. monthly/quarterly/half yearly.*

5.2.3 Reviewed progress of civil works (quality and problems), the Ward Councilor on behalf of WLCCs are more concern and supportive in solving local problems and to expedite civil works progress. *But fact is that WLCC's as a whole are not that active in regards to review progress, problem and quality of civil works under CGP.*

5.2.4 Presented progress of civil works in CSCC meeting (through ward councilors), the Ward Councilor him/herself some time presents progress and problems in CSCC meetings *that are not regular and reflection of WLCC's opinion.*

5.2.5 Conducted awareness raising activity for payment of tax and user charges, WLCCs conduct occasional awareness raising activity at ward level for payment of tax and user charges, *need to follow project guideline.*

5.2.6 Involved implementation and management of WASH, SW, and Street Light etc. WLCCs are partly involved in implementation and management of WASH, SW and Street Light etc. activities as their tradition, *required to promote WLCC's active role as per project guideline.*

5.2.7 Arranged open discussion on overall activities (inviting 150 citizens) twice a year, none of the WLCCs arranged such open discussion on overall activities of the ward including budget allocation from CC and peoples demand through inviting 150 citizens at ward levels.

Activity 5.3: Integration of Community and Formation of Community Group (CG)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
5.3.1 Conducted workshop on concept and implementation of CG activity according to the PCO guideline	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.3.2 Formed CG in target wards for pilot activity	As req.	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
5.3.3 provided training to CG members on management & implementation of activities	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.3.4 Reviewed the activities of waste collection and other social issues	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.3.5 Conducted training for CG on 3R	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.3.6 Formed community base organization (CBO) in the core area of pilot wards	As req.	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

5.3.1 Conducted workshop on concept and implementation of CG activity according to the PCO guideline, none of the CCs conducted workshop on concept and implementation of CG activity according to the PCO guideline.

5.3.2 Formed CG in target wards for pilot activity, NCC selected ward 13, 14, 15, 16 & 18 for pilot activities, CoCC 13, 14, 15 & 16, and ChCC selected ward 7, 8, 15, 22, 23, 31 & 36 for pilot activities. Among 3 CCs, only NCC formed CGs and CBOs in selected wards for waste collection activity. RpCC and GCC have not yet selected ward for pilot activities and CoCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC upon selection of pilot wards have to form CGs and CBOs for waste collection activity.

5.3.3 Provided training to CG members on management & implementation of activities, none of the CCs provided training to CG members on management & implementation of pilot activities, since CGs are not formed other than NCC recently.

5.3.4 Reviewed the activities of waste collection and other social issues, none of the CCs reviewed the activities of waste collection and other social issues in targeted wards, since activities are not yet started.

5.3.5 Conducted training for CG on 3R, none of the CCs conducted training for CG members on 3R, since the activity has not been started.

5.3.6 Formed community base organization (CBO) in the core area of pilot wards, only NCC formed CBOs in the core area of selected pilot wards to perform waste collection activities, rest four CCs have not yet formed CBOs.

Activity 5.4: Gender action plan (GAP) prepared

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
5.4.1 Prepared Gender Action Plan (GAP)	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.4.2 GAP endorsed by CSCC	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.4.3 GAP approved by CC meeting	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.4.4 Assigned officer to perform secretarial work for the Women Development Standing Committee	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.4.5 CC allocated budget for GAP implementation	3/CC	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.4.6 Prepared quarterly and annual report	10/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

5.4.1 Prepared gender action plan, none of the CCs prepared Gender Action Plan (GAP).

5.4.2 GAP endorsed by CSCC, none of the CCs approached to CSCC for endorsement of GAP, since GAP is not prepared.

5.4.3 GAP approved by CC meeting, none of the CCs approached to City Council meeting for approval of GAP, since GAP is not prepared and endorsed by CSCCs.

5.4.4 Assigned officer to perform secretarial work of the Women Development Standing Committee, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC have assigned officer to perform secretarial work of the Women Development Standing Committees on ---/---/---, ---/---/---, ---/---/---, ---/---/---, 23.3.2016, and ---/---/---, respectively.

5.4.5 CC allocated budget for GAP implementation, only CoCC allocated budget (FY 2016-17) for GAP implementation, rest 4 CCs did not allocated budget for GAP implementation.

5.4.6 Prepared quarterly and annual reports, none of the Women Development Standing Committees at CC prepared quarterly and annual progress report no GAP implementation.

Activity 5.5: Poverty reduction action plan (PRAP) prepared and implemented with inclusion of slum

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
5.5.1 Established steering committee as per composition	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.2 Task Team (Micro Credit)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.3 Task Team (Education & Health)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.4 Task Team (Physical Work)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A
5.5.5 Prepared PRAP by poverty reduction standing committee with budget	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.5.6 Held workshop on PRAP guideline	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.7 PRAP revised and endorsed by CSCC	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.5.8 Selected and approved slum	10/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.9 Formed primary female user group	150/C	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.10 Established mother and child care services	10/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.11 Established satellite school service	10/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.12 Established saving, credit and IGAs	10/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.13 Provided training on IGAs	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.5.14 Provided small infrastructure development services	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.5.15 PRAP approved by CC meeting	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.5.16 Prepared annual report	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

5.5.1 Established Steering Committee as per composition, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established Steering Committees for PRAP implementation as per composition on 1.10.2015, 22.11.2015, 31.12.2015, 23.3.2016 and 24.1.2016 respectively.

5.5.2 Task Team (Micro Credit), NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established task team (micro credit) for PRAP implementation on 1.10.2015, 22.11.2015, 31.12.2015, 23.3.2016 and 24.1.2016 respectively.

5.5.3 Task Team (Education & Health), NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established task team (Education & Health) for PRAP implementation as per composition on 1.10.2015, 22.11.2015, 31.12.2015, 23.3.2016 and 24.1.2016 respectively.

5.5.4 Task Team (physical work), NCC, CoCC, RpCC, and ChCC established task team (physical work) for PRAP implementation as per composition on 1.10.2015, 22.11.2015, 31.12.2015, and 24.1.2016 respectively. **GCC have to form task team yet for physical work.**

5.5.5 Prepared PRAP by Poverty Reduction Standing Committee with Budget, none of the Poverty Reduction Standing Committees at CC level prepared Poverty Reduction Action Plan (PRAP) with budget, but NCC and CoCC have allocated budget for poverty reduction and slum development.

5.5.6 Held workshop on PRAP guideline, GICD organized and facilitated workshop on PRAP guideline for NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC elected representatives and officials on 8.11.2015, --/--/--, 30.12.2015, 20.12.2015 and 20.12.2015 respectively.

5.5.7 PRAP revised and endorsed by CSCC, none of the CSCCs at CC level have revised and endorsed Poverty Reduction Action Plan (PRAP), because PRAP has not prepared yet.

5.5.8 Selected and approved slum, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC approved 10 slums each and NCC 17 slums (in 10 packages in each CC) in their Council meeting 29.2.2016, 22.12.2015, 31.12.2015, 10.12.2015 and 28.12.2015 respectively to lunch Poverty Reduction Program.

5.5.9 Formed primary female user group, NCC, CoCC, RpCC and ChCC formed 150 primary female user groups each and GCC formed 145 between January and May 2016 under 30 CDCs each.

5.5.10 Established mother and child care services, primary health education/care services including mother and child care have been started in selected slums.

5.5.11 Established satellite school service, all 5 CCs started pre-primary education service between March and May 2016 in selected slums.

5.5.12 Established saving, credit and IGAs, all 5 CCs started saving program in each primary female user groups between March and May 2016. **Credit and IGA activities are yet to start.**

5.5.13 Provided training on IGAs, provided IGA training to project deployed pre-primary school tracers, health workers and community organizers. **Need based IGA training for beneficiaries have to initiate yet.**

5.5.14 Provided small infrastructure development services, infrastructure development services in the slums or slum areas are yet to initiate.

5.5.15 PRAP approved by CC meeting, none of the City Corporation approved PRAP, since it has not prepared and presented to City Council meeting for approval.

5.5.16 Prepared annual report, reports are not produced yet.

Activity 5.6: Revision of citizen charter

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
5.6.1 Assigned working group/officer in charge for preparation/revision of the citizen charter	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A
5.6.2 Revised citizen charter approved by CSCC	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	N/A
5.6.3 Revised citizen charter annually	2/CC	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No
5.6.4 Displayed citizen charter	2/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

5.6.1 Assigned working group/officer in charge for preparation/revision of the citizen charter, reported that NCC, CoCC and ChCC have assigned working group/officer in-charge for preparation/revision for Citizen Charter on 7.4.2016, 14.6.2016, and 20.4.2016. Rest two CCs observed no initiative.

5.6.2 Revised citizen charter approved by CSCC, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, and ChCC have discussed the content of citizen charter in CSCCs at CC level on 29.3.2016, 29.3.2016, 07.9.2016, and 20.4.2016. **In GCC no initiative observed.**

5.6.3 Revised citizen charter annually, NCC, RPCC and GCC have revised citizen charter once. CoCC and ChCC have not revised citizen charter. None of the CCs fined justification to revise citizen charter annually.

5.6.4 Displayed citizen charter, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC have displayed revised citizen charter on public place and on CC web site; **CoCC has to displayed citizen charter yet.**

Activity 5.7: Citizen report cards prepared, approved and implemented by CSCC

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
5.7.1 Assigned 3 members task team to organize citizen report card survey	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.7.2 Conducted minimum 500 questionnaire survey	3/CC	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
5.7.3 Discussed draft CRC report and recommendation taken from CSCC	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.7.4 Compiled the result and disclose at least twice within phase-2	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

5.7.1 Assigned 3 members task team to organize citizen report card survey, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC assigned 3 members task team to organize citizen report card survey on 7.4.2016, 14.6. 2016, ---/--/--, ---/--/--, and 14.02.2017 respectively. **None of task teams are actively involved in citizen report card survey.**

5.7.2 Conducted minimum 500 questionnaire survey, all 5 CCs started to conduct citizen survey using CRC to get feedback on CC services from households, commercial and other social institutions on January 2017. **But the CRC was prepared by GICD team that is not as per guideline.**

5.7.3 Discussed draft CRC report and recommendation taken from CSCC, the report is under preparation, so yet to wait for discussion and recommendation from CSCC.

5.7.4 Compiled the result and disclose at least twice within phase-2, yet to wait for result compilation and disclosure.

Activity 5.8: Grievance -redress cell (GRC) established with revised terms of reference and functional

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
5.8.1 Assigned official to set the GRC	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	N/A
5.8.2 Established Grievance Redress Cell at CC office.	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.8.3 Held one or more GRC meeting every month along with APs	30/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.8.4 Invited the potential complaints in the GRC and held meeting if require	30/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.8.5 Kept record of all Grievances	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.8.6 Presented grievance redress agenda in City Corporation meeting for taking appropriate action	30/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

5.8.1 Assigned official to set the GRC, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC assigned officer in-charge on 30.6.2015, 14.6.2016 - -/--/--, --/--/--/ and 20.6.2016

5.8.2 Established Grievance Redress Cell at CC office. NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established Grievance Redress Cell at CC office on 28.12.2014, 24.12.2014, 6.1.2015, 23.12.2014 and 21.12.2014 respectively. **NCC need to re-establish GRC after sitting recent elected City Council.**

5.8.3 Held one or more GRC meeting every month along with APs, all 5 CCs used to hold need based GRC meetings, not in a structured manner, since compensation issues are absent in the project.

5.8.4 Invited the potential complaints in the GRC and held meeting, if require, all 5 CCs used to invite potential complaints in the GRC and held meeting, whenever require

5.8.5 Kept record of all Grievances, all 5 CCs used to keep record of all Grievances

5.8.6 Presented grievance redress agenda in City Corporation meeting for taking appropriate action, all 5CCs used to present grievance redress agenda in City Corporation meeting for taking appropriate action.

Area 6: Urban Planning and Environment Improvement

Activity 6.1: Initiate/update master plan

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
6.1.1 Available master plan (including drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.	1/CC	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A
6.1.2 Available detailed area plan	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.1.3 Available action plan for infrastructure and public facilities	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.1.4 Assigned officer in charge for each plan	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.1.5 Established committee for each plan	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

6.1.1 Available master plan (including drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc. CoCC and RpCC have their master plan since long ago but waiting for approval and ChCC master plan lies with CDA. The part of NCC and GCC are under DMDP, 1997 (RAJUK) and for remaining part LGED prepared Action Area Plan.

6.1.2 Available detailed area plan, NCC, RPCC, GCC and ChCC, have their detail area plan, among them NCC and GCC plans are partial for part which are beyond RAJUK. **CoCC does not have detail area plan.**

6.1.3 Available action plan for infrastructure and public facilities, none of the CCs prepared their action plan for infrastructure and public facilities.

6.1.4 Assigned officer in charge for each plan, none of the CCs have assigned officer in charge for each plan.

6.1.5 Established committee for each plan, none of the CCs established committee for each plan.

Activity 6.2: Development control implemented (T10), N/A FOR NCC

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
6.2.1 Assigned at least one qualified officer in charge for building permission	1/CC	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	Yes
6.2.2 Defined signatory for application procedure	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.2.3 Identified illegal buildings	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.2.4 Taken any action for illegal buildings	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

6.2.1 Assigned at least one qualified officer in charge for building permission; NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC (3) and ChCC assigned officer in charge for building permission on 29.12.2015, 31.12.2015, 22.12.2015, 3.1.2016 and 30.12.2015 respectively.

6.2.2 Defined signatory for application procedure, all 5 CCs defined signatory for application procedure since long ago.

6.2.2 Defined signatory for application procedure, all 5 CCs defined signatory for application procedure since long ago.

6.2.3 Identified illegal buildings, none of the CCs identified illegal buildings.

6.2.4 Taken any action for illegal buildings, none of the CCs taken any action for illegal buildings.

Activity 6.3: Practical use of City Corporation Infrastructure Development Plan (CCIDP)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
6.3.1 Published IDP in website or print copy for citizen access	2/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
6.3.2 Shared revise IDP in CDCC by 2nd quarter in each year	3/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
6.3.3 Approved revise IDP by CC Parishad	3/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
6.3.4 Approached to financial supporters to promote IDP	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

6.3.1 Published IDP in website or print copy for citizen access, all CCs made available their IDP either in website or print copy for citizen access for 1st batch sub-projects and **for 2nd batch yet to make available**.

6.3.2 Shared revise IDP in CDCC by 2nd quarter, NCC, CoCC, RpCC (2), GCC (2) and ChCC shared revise IDP in CDCC meeting on 26.4.2016, 23.8.2016, 25.4.2016 & 6.9.2016, 20.4.2016 & 6.12.2016 and 18.4.2016 out of three.

6.3.3 Approved revise IDP by CC Parishad, NCC, CoCC, RpCC (2), GCC (2) and ChCC approved IDP by CC Parishad on 16.05.2016, 28.12.2016, 24.05.2016, 16.5.2016 and ----/-----/----- respectively.

6.3.4 Approached to financial supporters to promote IDP, **none of the CCs approached for practical promotion to any financial supporters**.

Activity 6.4: Establish O&M action plan

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
6.4.1 Available approved O&M action plan from PCO	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.4.2 Implemented O&M action plan	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

6.4.1 Available approved O&M action plan from PCO, all CCs prepared and received O&M action plan and finally obtained approval from PCO for 1st batch sub-projects.

6.4.2 Implemented O&M action plan, all CCs will implement O&M action plan from next year.

Activity 6.5: Environmental Conservation Act and Environment Framework (T11)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
6.5.1 Assigned officer(s) in charge environmental conservation	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.5.2 Complied act and rules in its infrastructure development	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.5.3 Identified environmentally vulnerable areas and activities against Environmental Conservation Act	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.5.4 Taken action to stop the illegal activities which are not relay with Environmental Conservation Act	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

6.5.1 Assigned officer(s) in charge environmental conservation, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC assigned officer(s) in charge environmental conservation on 29.12.2015, 31.12.2015, 14.09.2015, 3.1.2016 and 30.12.2015 respectively.

6.5.2 Complied act and rules in its infrastructure development, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC complied act and rules in its infrastructure development for 54 sub-projects of batch-1, and **for batch-2 process have been initiated.**

6.5.3 Identified environmentally vulnerable areas and activities against Environmental Conservation Act, none of the CCs identified environmentally vulnerable areas and activities that are against Environmental Conservation Act.

6.5.4 Taken action to stop the illegal activities which are not relay with Environmental Conservation Act, none of the CCs taken action yet to stop the illegal activities which are not relay with Environmental Conservation Act.

Activity 6.6: Sanitary Situation

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
6.6.1 Assigned officer in charge for sanitation	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.6.2 Available situation analysis on overall sanitation condition	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.6.3 Available demand analysis and area selection for public and household toilets	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.6.4 Build public toilets	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.6.5 Maintained and operate public toilets	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6.6.6 Facilitated household toilet installation	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.6.7 Increased drainage connection for households waste water	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

6.6.1 Assigned officer in charge for sanitation, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC assigned officer in charge for sanitation on 29.12.2015, 31.12.2015, 27.12.2015, 3.1.2016 and 30.12.2015 respectively.

6.6.2 Available situation analysis on overall sanitation condition, none of the CCs carried out situation analysis on overall sanitation condition.

6.6.3 Available demand analysis and area selection for public and household toilets, none of the CCs carried out demand analysis and area selection for public and household toilets.

6.6.4 Build public toilets, none of the CCs build public toilets from CGP support yet.

6.6.5 Maintained and operate public toilets, all CCs maintained and operates existing public toilets as their tradition.

6.6.6 Facilitated household toilet installation, none of the CCs facilitated household toilet installation yet from CGP support.

6.6.7 Increased drainage connection for households' waste water, none of the CCs increased drainage connection for households' waste water.

Activity 6.7: Solid Waste Management (T12)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
6.7.1 Assigned officers in charge for SWM, phase-1	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
6.7.2 Established SWM committee (SC), phase-1	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
6.7.3 Prepared SWM plan, phase-1	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.7.4 Trained staff on SWM, phase-1	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.7.5 Signed agreement between CG and WLCC, phase-1	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.7.6 Established primary waste collection system in collaboration with CBO/private sectors, phase-1	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6.7.7 Located dustbins, solid waste deposits and transfer station in collaboration with community, phase-1	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6.7.8 Coordinated to clean solid waste from road and drainage, phase-1	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6.7.9 Collected solid waste in wider area and dispose it into a specific dumping site, phase-2	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6.7.10 Initiated 3R piloting	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

6.7.1 Assigned officers in charge for solid waste management, phase-1, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC Assigned officers in charge for solid waste management during phase-1 on 29.12.2015, 31.12.2015, 27.12.2015, 3.1.2016 and 30.12.2015.

6.7.2 Established solid waste management committee (SC), phase-1, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established solid waste management committee (SC) in phase-1 on 13.11.2014, --/--/--, 25.11.2015, 17.05.2016 and 5.11.2015.

6.7.3 Prepared solid waste management plan, phase-1, *none of the CCs prepared solid waste management plan in phase-1.*

6.7.4 Trained staff for solid waste management, phase-1, *none of the CCs trained staff for solid waste management in phase-1.*

6.7.5 Signed agreement between CG and WLCC, phase-1, *no of the CCs signed agreement between CG and WLCC in phase-1 for SWM.*

6.7.6 Established primary waste collection system in collaboration with CBO/private sectors, phase-1, reported that all CCs established primary waste collection system in phase-1 as their tradition, *not in collaboration with CBO/private sectors.*

6.7.7 Located dustbins, solid waste deposits and transfer station in collaboration with community, phase-1, reported that all CCs located dustbins, solid waste deposits and transfer station in phase-1 as their tradition, *not in collaboration with community.*

6.7.8 Coordinated to clean solid waste from road and drainage, phase-1, reported that all CCs coordinates to clean solid waste from road and drainage in phase-1, as their tradition.

6.7.9 Collected solid waste in wider area and dispose it into a specific dumping site, phase-2, reported that all CCs collects solid waste in wider area and disposes it into a specific dumping site in phase-2 as their tradition, *but none of the CCs have designated dumping site.*

6.7.10 Initiated 3R piloting, *none of CCs initiated 3R piloting.*

Area 7: Coordination System for Law Enforcement

Activity 7.1: Awareness campaign for Rule of Law (T13)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
7.1.1 Assigned Law Officer	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
7.1.2 Prepared plans and budget for awareness campaign	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.1.3 Plans and budget approved by CC	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.1.4 Implemented campaign activity	3/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
7.1.5 Submitted report to Mayor & CEO	3/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

7.1.1 Assigned Law Officer, NCC assigned J.M. Sattar on 24.12.2015; RpCC assigned Magistrate on 10.01.2016, GCC assigned Md. Aslam Hossain, Secretary on 21.1.2016; and ChCC assigned Md. Soroary Alam on ---/---/--- as Law Officer.

7.1.2 Prepared plans and budget for awareness campaign, none of the CCs prepared annual plans and budget for awareness campaign, but CC's implemented awareness campaign on Rule of Law with financial support from CGP.

7.1.3 Plans and budget approved by CC, none of the CCs approved annual budget for campaign activities that are supported from CGP.

7.1.4 Implemented campaign activity, NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC implemented campaign activity on rule of law on 25.4.2016, 26.4.2016, 20.4.2016, 24.4.2016, and 27.4.2016 respectively.

7.1.5 Submitted report to Mayor & CEO, awareness campaign reports on Rule of Law are prepared **but not submitted to Mayor and CEO**.

Activity 7.2: Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) established

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
7.2.1 Established Law Enforcement Unit (LEU)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
7.2.2 Signed LEU circular by Mayor and distributed	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
7.2.3 Conducted workshop on LEU guideline and activity	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.2.4 Prepared plans and budget for law enforcement	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.2.5 Conducted training on law enforcement	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.2.6 Implemented law enforcement activity	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.2.7 Produced report on law enforcement	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.2.8 Established trial court	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

7.2.1 Established Law Enforcement Unit (LEU), NCC, CoCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) on 23.12.2015, 24.12.2014, 1.1.2015, 18.10.2015 and 15.12.2015 respectively.

7.2.2 Signed LEU circular by Mayor and distributed, all 5 CCs issued circular in regards to establishment of Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) signed by respective Mayor.

7.2.3 Conducted workshop on LEU guideline and activity, *none of the CCs conducted workshop on LEU guideline and started activity since establishment.*

7.2.4 Prepared plans and budget for law enforcement, *none of the CCs prepared plans and budget for Law Enforcement Unit operation.*

7.2.5 Conducted training on law enforcement, *none of the CCs provided training to concern officials and Standing Committee for Law and Discipline members on Law Enforcement.*

7.2.6 Implemented law enforcement activity, all CCs performs law enforcement activities as usual, whenever necessary.

7.2.6 Produced report on law enforcement, *none of the CCs produced report on law enforcement activities.*

7.2.7 Established trial court, all CCs establishes trial court where and whenever necessary.

Activity 7.3: Capacity development for Standing Committee for Law and Discipline implemented

Sub-activity/ Task	Target till Q2, Y3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3	Till Q-1, Y-3	In Q-2, Y-3
7.3.1 Participated training on law enforcement	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.3.2 Examined awareness campaign on law	3/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.3.3 Examined plan of law enforcement activities	1/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

Analysis:

7.3.1 Participated training on law enforcement, *none of the CC officials and Standing Committee for Law and Discipline members participated in training course on Law Enforcement.*

7.3.2 Examined awareness campaign on law, Departments at CC level raises law related issues to the Law Officer for examining and proposing possible action whenever necessary.

7.3.3 Examined plan of law enforcement activities, usually Law Officer examines raised law related issues and proposes possible action.

4.2 Component-2: Infrastructure Development

Batch1: Physical and Financial progress by sub-projects

a. Narayanganj City Corporation

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
NCCB1-01	87	83
NCCB1-02	100	88
NCCB1-03	100	88

NCCB1-01, restricted progress because, there are two electric pools on link-2, private land problem on link-5, an electric pool on drain link-6 and a three storied building on main road.

b. Comilla City Corporation

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
CoCCB1-01	100	80
CoCCB1-02	100	78
CoCCB1-03	100	82

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
CoCCB1-04	100	76
CoCCB1-05	98	79
CoCCB1-06	97	77
CoCCB1-07	100	84
CoCCB1-08	0	0
CoCCB1-09	100	100

Package CoCCB1-08, implemented by other agency

b. Rangpur City Corporation

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
RpCCB1-01	100	90
RpCCB1-02	63	51
RpCCB1-03	100	79
RpCCB1-04	45	24
RpCCB1-05	100	82
RpCCB1-06	68	63
RpCCB1-07	95	87
RpCCB1-08	95	72
RpCCB1-09	98	78
RpCCB1-10	87	75
RpCCB1-11	75	54
RpCCB1-12	80	61
RpCCB1-13	96	68
RpCCB1-14	80	55
RpCCB1-15	76	67
RpCCB1-16	77	56
RpCCB1-17	100	85
RpCCB1-18	85	61

RpCCB1-02, progress restricted due to delayed start of work due to rainy season, non availability of bricks, and delayed revises decision

RpCCB1-04, progress restricted due to delayed start of work due to rainy season, non availability of bricks, and

RpCCB1-06, progress restricted due to negligence of contractor.

c. Gazipur City Corporation

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
GCCB1-01	38	30
GCCB1-02	74	55
GCCB1-03	27	20
GCCB1-04	53	22
GCCB1-05	37	17
GCCB1-06	90	80
GCCB1-07	70	49
GCCB1-08	52	43
GCCB1-09	90	84

GCCB1-01 & GCCB1-05, progress restricted due to contractor's negligence and delayed recast decision

GCCB1-03, progress restricted due to contractor's negligence

GCCB1-04, progress restricted due to contractor's negligence, and

GCCB1-08, progress restricted due to contractor's negligence

d. Chittagong City Corporation

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
ChCCB1-01	90	46
ChCCB1-02	95	60
ChCCB1-03	70	44
ChCCB1-04	95	75
ChCCB1-05	0	0
ChCCB1-06	35	26
ChCCB1-07	5	0
ChCCB1-08	10	0
ChCCB1-09	35	28
ChCCB1-10	65	62
ChCCB1-11	90	79
ChCCB1-12	95	85
ChCCB1-13	95	84
ChCCB1-14	0	0
ChCCB1-15	35	14
ChCCB1-16	15	5
ChCCB1-17	55	39
ChCCB1-18	35	28

ChCCB1-05, implemented by other agency

ChCCB1-06, ChCCB1-07 & ChCCB1-08, progress restricted due to work stop, reason not known

ChCCB1-09 & ChCCB1-10, progress restricted due to delayed recast decision.

ChCCB1-14, progress restricted due to re-tender on 13 March 2017

ChCCB1-15, progress restricted, because contractor delayed 4 months to start work due to rainy season

ChCCB1-16, progress restricted due to delayed design correction

ChCCB1-17 progress restricted due to delayed recast decision, and

ChCCB1-18, progress restricted, because contractor delayed to start work after several reminders and delayed recast decision

Batch1: Implementation Time Schedule by Sub-projects

a. Narayanganj City Corporation

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 st Extended	2 nd Extended
NCCB1-01	365	54	62
NCCB1-02	365	195	93
NCCB1-03	365	165	123

All 3 sub-projects (NCCB1-01, NCCB1-02, & NCCB1-03) had to extent time twice.

b. Comilla City Corporation

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 st Extended	2 nd Extended
CoCCB1-01	365	138	0
CoCCB1-02	365	155	0
CoCCB1-03	365	221	0

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 st Extended	2 nd Extended
CoCCB1-04	365	82	102
CoCCB1-05	365	75	66
CoCCB1-06	365	75	78
CoCCB1-07	365	307	0
CoCCB1-08			
CoCCB1-09	365	288	0

Out of 9 sub-projects 3 (CoCCB1-04, CoCCB1-05 & CoCCB1-06) had to extent time twice, 5 (CoCCB1-01, CoCCB1-02, CoCCB1-03, CoCCB1-07 & CoCCB1-09) had to extent time once and 1 sub-project (CoCCB1-08) implemented by other agency.

c. Rangpur City Corporation

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 st Extended	2 nd Extended
RpCCB1-01	365	272	
RpCCB1-02	365	260	
RpCCB1-03	365	115	
RpCCB1-04	365		
RpCCB1-05	365	117	
RpCCB1-06	365	73	48
RpCCB1-07	365	84	53
RpCCB1-08	365	42	
RpCCB1-09	365	42	
RpCCB1-10	365	26	
RpCCB1-11	365	34	
RpCCB1-12	365	34	
RpCCB1-13	365	26	
RpCCB1-14	365	84	
RpCCB1-15	365	84	
RpCCB1-16	365	53	
RpCCB1-17	365	71	13
RpCCB1-18	365	124	

Out of 18 sub-projects 3 (RpCCB1-06, RpCCB1-07 & RpCCB1-17) had to extent time twice, 14 (RpCCB1-01, RpCCB1-02, RpCCB1-03, RpCCB1-05, RpCCB1-08, RpCCB1-09, RpCCB1-10, RpCCB1-11, RpCCB1-12, RpCCB1-13, RpCCB1-14, RpCCB1-15, RpCCB1-16 & RpCCB1-18) had to extent time once and 1 sub-project (RpCCB1-04) did not require time extension.

d. Gazipur City Corporation

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 st Extended	2 nd Extended
GCCB1-01	365	72	
GCCB1-02	365	72	74
GCCB1-03	365	72	
GCCB1-04	365	72	
GCCB1-05	365	72	
GCCB1-06	365	72	
GCCB1-07	365	72	97
GCCB1-08	365	91	
GCCB1-09	365	72	95

Out of 9 sub-projects 3 (GCCB1-02, GCCB1-07 & GCCB1-09) had to extent time twice, 6 (GCCB1-01, GCCB1-03, GCCB1-04, GCCB1-05, GCCB1-06 and GCCB1-08) had to extent time once.

e. Chittagong City Corporation

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 st Extended	2 nd Extended
ChCCB1-01	365	56	
ChCCB1-02	365	56	
ChCCB1-03	365	56	
ChCCB1-04	365	85	
ChCCB1-05			
ChCCB1-06	365	49	
ChCCB1-07	365	110	
ChCCB1-08	365	110	
ChCCB1-09	365	49	
ChCCB1-10	365	49	
ChCCB1-11	365	84	26
ChCCB1-12	365	84	26
ChCCB1-13	365	84	26
ChCCB1-14			
ChCCB1-15	365		
ChCCB1-16	365	56	
ChCCB1-17	365	27	
ChCCB1-18	365	20	

Out of 18 sub-projects 3 (ChCCB1-11, ChCCB1-12 & ChCCB1-13) had to extent time twice, 12 (ChCCB1-01, ChCCB1-02, ChCCB1-03, ChCCB1-04, ChCCB1-06, ChCCB1-07, ChCCB1-08, ChCCB1-09, ChCCB1-10, ChCCB1-16, ChCCB1-17 & ChCCB1-18) had to extent time once, 1 sub-project (ChCCB1-05) implemented by other agency and 1 sub-project (ChCCB1-14) need re-tender.

5. Challenges of the program

- Role clarity of the participating agencies and personnel
- Translation of ICGIAP into Annual Implementation Plan
- Weak link between national service providing agencies and project delivered services (particularly health, education and credit support)
- Absence of feedback sharing process, and
- Divert attention to content from process in program implementation.